

EPPING FOREST DISTRICT COUNCIL COMMITTEE MINUTES

Committee: Area Planning Subcommittee **Date:** 27 June 2012
South

Place: Roding Valley High School, Brook Road, Loughton, Essex IG10 3JA **Time:** 7.30 - 8.50 pm

Members Present: J Hart (Chairman), Ms S Watson (Vice-Chairman), G Chambers, Mrs T Cochrane, R Cohen, L Girling, Ms J Hart, L Leonard, A Lion, J Markham, Mrs C Pond, Mrs T Thomas, H Ulkun and D Wixley

Other Councillors:

Apologies: K Angold-Stephens, K Chana, C Finn, J Knapman, H Mann, G Mohindra, S Murray, B Sandler and Mrs L Wagland

Officers Present: S Solon (Principal Planning Officer), K Smith (Senior Planning Officer), C Neilan (Landscape Officer & Arboriculturist), G J Woodhall (Democratic Services Officer), A Hendry (Democratic Services Officer) and M Jenkins (Democratic Services Assistant)

8. WEBCASTING INTRODUCTION

The Chairman made a short address to remind all present that the meeting would be broadcast on the Internet, and that the Council had adopted a protocol for the webcasting of its meetings.

9. WELCOME AND INTRODUCTION

The Chairman welcomed members of the public to the meeting and outlined the procedures and arrangements adopted by the Council to enable persons to address the Sub-Committee, in relation to the determination of applications for planning permission. The Sub-Committee noted the advice provided for the public and speakers in attendance at Council Planning Sub-Committee meetings.

10. MINUTES

Resolved:

(1) That the minutes of the meeting held on 30 May 2012 be taken as read and signed by the Chairman as a correct record.

11. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

(a) Pursuant to the Council's Code of Member Conduct, Councillor A Lion declared a personal interest in the following items of the agenda, by virtue of being a member of Chigwell Parish Council. The Councillor had determined that his interest was not prejudicial and would remain in the meeting for the consideration of the applications and voting thereon:

- EPF/0498/12 Rear of 6 Shillibeer Walk, Chigwell; and
- EPF/0858/12 5 Canterbury Close, Chigwell

(b) Pursuant to the Council's Code of Member Conduct, Councillor A Lion declared a personal interest in the following item of the agenda, by virtue of being a resident of Canterbury Close. The Councillor had determined that his interest was not prejudicial and would remain in the meeting for the consideration of the application and voting thereon:

- EPF/0858/12 5 Canterbury Close, Chigwell.

(c) Pursuant to the Council's Code of Member Conduct, Councillor D Wixley declared a personal interest in the following items of the agenda by virtue of being a Tree Warden. The Councillor had determined that his interest was not prejudicial and would remain in the meeting for the consideration of the applications and voting thereon:

- EPF/0498/12 Rear of 6 Shillibeer Walk, Chigwell;
- EPF/0858/12 5 Canterbury Close, Chigwell; and
- EPF/0962/12 3 Alderton Mews, Loughton.

(d) Pursuant to the Council's Code of Member Conduct, Councillors T Cochrane, R Cohen, L Girling, Jennie Hart, L Leonard, J Markham, C Pond and D Wixley declared a personal interest in the following items of the agenda, by virtue of being a member of Loughton Residents Association. The Councillors had determined that their interest was not prejudicial and would remain in the meeting for the consideration of the applications and voting thereon:

- EPF/0962/12 3 Alderton Mews, Loughton;
- EPF/0486/12 3 Church Hill, Loughton; and
- EPF/0931/12 182 Roding Road, Loughton.

(e) Pursuant to the Council's Code of Member Conduct, Councillors C Pond, T Thomas and D Wixley declared a personal interest in the following items of the agenda, by virtue of being a member of Loughton Town Council. The Councillors had determined that their interest was not prejudicial and would remain in the meeting for the consideration of the applications and voting thereon:

- EPF/0962/12 3 Alderton Mews, Loughton;
- EPF/0486/12 3 Church Hill, Loughton; and
- EPF/0931/12 182 Roding Road, Loughton.

(f) Pursuant to the Council's Code of Member Conduct, Councillor Jennie Hart declared a personal interest in the following item of the agenda by virtue of being acquainted with the objector. The Councillor had determined that her interest was prejudicial and would leave the meeting for the consideration of the application and voting thereon:

- EPF/0486/12 3 Church Hill, Loughton.

(g) Pursuant to the Council's Code of Member Conduct, Councillors G Chambers, H Ulkun and S Watson declared a personal interest in the following item of the agenda by virtue of being a member of Buckhurst Hill Parish Council. The Councillors had determined that their interest was not prejudicial and would remain in the meeting for the consideration of the application and voting thereon:

- EPF/0634/12 170-174 Queens Road, Buckhurst Hill.

12. ANY OTHER BUSINESS

It was noted that there was no other urgent business for consideration by the Subcommittee.

13. DEVELOPMENT CONTROL

The Sub-Committee considered a schedule of applications for planning permission.

Resolved:

(1) That the planning applications numbered 1 – 6 be determined as set out in the attached schedule to these minutes.

14. PROBITY IN PLANNING - APPEAL DECISIONS, OCTOBER 2011 TO MARCH 2012

The Senior Planning Officer presented a report concerning the planning appeal decisions for the period October 2011 to March 2012.

The Senior Planning Officer reported that, for this particular Sub-Committee, there had been two appeals allowed by the Planning Inspector where the Sub-Committee had refused the application contrary to the Officer's recommendation. These were:

- (i) EPF/2151/10 Loyola Preparatory School, 103 Palmerston Road
Revised application for the provision of an artificial playing surface and surround fencing to the existing playing field; and
- (ii) EPF/2664/10 Woolston Manor, Abridge Road
Use of motel building (class C1) for residential purposes as 26 apartments (class C3).

The Senior Planning Officer stated that, whilst performance in defending appeals had improved, the Sub-Committee was reminded of the need for justifiable reasons for refusing planning permission that were not only relevant and necessary but also sound and defensible. Refusing a planning application contrary to the Officer's recommendation should only be contemplated in cases where the Sub-Committee was certain that they were acting in the wider public interest. Such instances were now the subject of a separate Key Performance Indicator (KPI 55) and would be under greater scrutiny in the future.

Resolved:

(1) That the Planning Appeal Decisions for the period October 2011 to March 2012 be noted.

15. DELEGATED DECISIONS

The Sub-Committee noted that schedules of planning applications determined by the Director of Planning and Economic Development under delegated authority since the last meeting had been circulated and could be inspected at the Civic Offices.

CHAIRMAN

This page is intentionally left blank

Report Item No: 1

APPLICATION No:	EPF/0498/12
SITE ADDRESS:	Rear of 6 Shillibeer Walk Chigwell Essex IG7 6JA
PARISH:	Chigwell
WARD:	Chigwell Row
DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:	TPO/EPF/28/82 T8 - Sycamore - Fell
DECISION:	Grant Permission (With Conditions)

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case:

http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/AniteIM.websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=535842

CONDITIONS

1. A replacement tree or trees, of a number, species, size and in a position as agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority, shall be planted within one month of the implementation of the felling hereby agreed, unless varied with the written agreement of the Local Planning Authority. If within a period of five years from the date of planting any replacement tree is removed, uprooted or destroyed, dies or becomes seriously damaged or defective another tree of the same species and size as that originally planted shall be planted at the same place, unless the Local Planning Authority gives its written consent to any variation.
2. The Local Planning Authority shall receive in writing 5 working days notice of felling.

Report Item No: 2

APPLICATION No:	EPF/0858/12
SITE ADDRESS:	5 Canterbury Close Chigwell Essex IG7 6HG
PARISH:	Chigwell
WARD:	Chigwell Row
DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:	TPO/EPF/04/81 T6 - Sycamore - Fell
DECISION:	Grant Permission (With Conditions)

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case:

http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/AniTelM.websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=537256

CONDITIONS

1. A replacement tree of a species, size and in a position as agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority, shall be planted and inspected and agreed to be in accordance with the details prior to implementation of the felling hereby agreed, unless varied with a written agreement of the Local Planning Authority. If within a period of five years from the date of planting any replacement tree is removed, uprooted or destroyed, or dies, or becomes seriously damaged and defective another tree of the same species and size of that originally planted shall be planted at the same place, unless the Local Planning Authority gives its written consent to any variation.
2. The Local Planning Authority shall receive, in writing, 5 working days notice of implementation of the felling.

Report Item No: 3

APPLICATION No:	EPF/0962/12
SITE ADDRESS:	3 Alderton Mews Alderton Hill Loughton IG10 3JE
PARISH:	Loughton
WARD:	Loughton Alderton
DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:	TPO/EPF/41/88 T1 - Cedar - Fell
DECISION:	Grant Permission (With Conditions)

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case:

http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/AniteIM.websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=537604

CONDITIONS

1. The works authorised by this consent shall be carried out following the Local Authority's receipt, in writing, of 5 working days notice of such works.
2. A replacement tree of a species, size and in a position as agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority, shall be planted and inspected and agreed to be in accordance with the details prior to implementation of the felling hereby agreed, unless varied with a written agreement of the Local Planning Authority. If within a period of five years from the date of planting any replacement tree is removed, uprooted or destroyed, or dies, or becomes seriously damaged and defective another tree of the same species and size of that originally planted shall be planted at the same place, unless the Local Planning Authority gives its written consent to any variation.

Report Item No: 4

APPLICATION No:	EPF/0486/12
SITE ADDRESS:	3 Church Hill Loughton Essex IG10 1QP
PARISH:	Loughton
WARD:	Loughton St Marys
DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:	Change of use of dwelling (use class C3) to pre-school day nursery (use class D1), single storey front extension and single storey extension to existing garage.
DECISION:	Refuse Permission

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case:

http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/AniteIM.websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=535795

It was reported to Committee that 2 additional representations had been received from 3 & 5 Church Hill,

REASONS FOR REFUSAL

1. The proposed development would increase the footprint of buildings within the site at the expense of outdoor play areas, amounting to an over development of the site, contrary to policies DBE1(i) and DBE3(i) of the Adopted Local Plan and Alterations (which are consistent with the policies contained in the National Planning Policy Framework).
2. The proposed development would be harmful to the amenities enjoyed by the occupiers of nearby residential properties in Upland Court and Church Hill contrary to policies DBE2 and RP5A (i) of the adopted Local Plan and Alterations (which are consistent with the policies contained in the National Planning Policy Framework).
3. The proposed garage extension, by reason of its unattractive design, would fail to respect its setting contrary to policy DBE1(i) of the adopted Local Plan and Alterations (which is consistent with the policies contained in the National Planning Policy Framework).

Report Item No: 5

APPLICATION No:	EPF/0634/12
SITE ADDRESS:	170-174 Queens Road Buckhurst Hill Essex IG9 5BD
PARISH:	Buckhurst Hill
WARD:	Buckhurst Hill West
DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:	Variation of condition 2 of EPF/0311/93 to permit opening of nursery from 07.30 am to 06.30 pm on Monday to Saturdays.
DECISION:	Grant Permission (With Conditions)

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case:

http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/AniteIM.websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=536337

CONDITIONS

1. The day nursery shall only operate between the hours of 7.30am and 6.30pm on Mondays to Saturdays and at no times on Sundays.
2. Notwithstanding the provisions of the Town and Country Planning Use Classes Order 1987 or any Order revoking and re-enacting that Order, the property shall only be used as a day nursery or crèche.
3. If cooked food is to be provided for the children of the nursery, an extract duct, details of which shall be approved by the Local Planning Authority prior to its installation, shall be installed on the building prior to commencement of cooking. The duct shall be taken to at least 1 metre above the eaves of the building. The extraction unit shall be fitted with suitable carbon and grease filters to minimise the possibility of nuisance and odours. Any fan for the purpose of extraction should be provided with anti-vibration mounting and anti-vibration coupling and externally fitted fans should, in addition be acoustically enclosed.

Report Item No: 6

APPLICATION No:	EPF/0931/12
SITE ADDRESS:	182 Roding Road Loughton Essex IG10 3BS
PARISH:	Loughton
WARD:	Loughton Roding
DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:	Demolition of the existing house and garage. Construction of a block of five one-bedroom flats; new vehicle access cross-overs and external landscaping.
DECISION:	Refuse Permission

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case:

http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/AniteIM.websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=537471

REASON FOR REFUSAL

1. The range of products offered by local shops in close proximity to the site and the service provided by local public transport providers is not sufficient that the site may be judged as highly sustainable. Accordingly the provision of 4 parking spaces is inadequate for the proposed 5 flats and contrary to the Council's parking standards and policy DBE6 of the adopted Local Plan and Alterations (which is consistent with the policies contained in the National Planning Policy Framework).